

Peabody College of Education and Human Development | 230 Appleton Place, Nashville, TN 37203

2022 Prenatal-to-3 State Policy Roadmap

Methods and Sources

Effective Strategies

EARLY HEAD START

What is Early Head Start and why is it important?

All references for this section are provided in the Notes and Sources section at the bottom of each webpage. Additionally, search the <u>Prenatal-to-3 Policy Clearinghouse</u> for an ongoing inventory of rigorous evidence reviews, including more information on Early Head Start.

What impact does Early Head Start have?

The following studies meet standards of strong causal evidence to demonstrate the impacts of Early Head Start for the health and wellbeing of young children and their families:

- A. Ayoub, C., Vallotton, C. D., & Mastergeorge, A. M. (2011). Developmental pathways to integrated social skills: The roles of parenting and early intervention. *Child Development*, 82(2), 583–600. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.2010.01549.x
- B. Bradley, R. H., McKelvey, L. M., & Whiteside-Mansell, L. (2011). Does the quality of stimulation and support in the home environment moderate the effect of early education programs? Child Development, 82(6), 2110–2122. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-8624.2011.01659.x
- C. Chazan-Cohen, R., Ayoub, C., Pan, B. A., Roggman, L., Raikes, H., McKelvey, L., Whiteside-Mansell, L., & Hart, A. (2007). It takes time: Impacts of Early Head Start that lead to reductions in maternal depression two years later. *Infant Mental Health Journal*, 28(2), 151–170. https://doi.org/10.1002/imhj.20127
- D. Chazan-Cohen, R., & Kisker, E. E. (2013). VI. Links between early care and education experiences birth to age 5 and prekindergarten outcomes. Monographs of the Society for Research in Child Development, 78(1), 110–129. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-5834.2012.00705.x
- E. Chazan-Cohen, R., Raikes, H. H., & Vogel, C. (2013). V. Program subgroups: Patterns of impacts for home-based, center-based, and mixed-approach programs. *Monographs of the Society for Research in Child Development*, 78(1), 93–109. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-5834.2012.00704.x
- F. Green, B. L., Ayoub, C., Bartlett, J. D., Von Ende, A., Furrer, C., Chazan-Cohen, R., Vallotton, C., & Klevens, J. (2014). The effect of Early Head Start on child welfare system involvement: A first look at longitudinal child maltreatment outcomes. *Children and Youth Services Review*, 42, 127–135. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.childyouth.2014.03.044
- G. Jones Harden, B., Chazan-Cohen, R., Raikes, H., & Vogel, C. (2012). Early Head Start home visitation: The role of implementation in bolstering program benefits. *Journal of Community Psychology*, *40*(4), 438–455. https://doi.org/10.1002/jcop.20525

- H. Jones Harden, B., Sandstrom, H., & Chazan-Cohen, R. (2012). Early Head Start and African American families: Impacts and mechanisms of child outcomes. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, *27*(4), 572–581. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecresq.2012.07.006
- Love, J. M., Eliason Kisker, E., Ross, C. M., Schochet, P. Z., Brooks-Gunn, J., Paulsell, D., Boller, K.,
 Constantine, J., Vogel, C., Sidle Fuligni, A., & Brady-Smith, C. (2001). Building their futures: How Early Head
 Start programs are enhancing the lives of infants and toddlers in low-income families. Mathematica Policy
 Research, Inc. https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/resource/building-their-futures-how-early-head-start-programs-are-enhancing-the-1
- J. Love, J. M., Eliason Kisker, E., Ross, C. M., Schochet, P. Z., Brooks-Gunn, J., Paulsell, D., Boller, K., Constantine, J., Vogel, C., Sidle Fuligni, A., & Brady-Smith, C. (2002). *Making a difference in the lives of infants and toddlers and their families: The Impacts of Early Head Start*. Mathematica Policy Research, Inc. https://www.acf.hhs.gov/sites/default/files/opre/impacts-vol1.pdf
- K. Love, J. M., Eliason Kisker, E., Ross, C. M., Schochet, P. Z., Brooks-Gunn, J., Paulsell, D., Boller, K., Constantine, J., Vogel, C., Sidle Fuligni, A., & Brady-Smith, C. (2004). *The role of Early Head Start programs in addressing the child care needs of low-income families with infants and toddlers: Influences on child care use and quality*. Mathematica Policy Research, Inc. https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/resource/the-role-of-early-head-start-programs-in-addressing-the-child-care-needs-of
- L. McKelvey, L., Schiffman, R. F., Brophy-Herb, H. E., Bocknek, E. L., Fitzgerald, H. E., Reischl, T. M., Hawver, S., & Deluca, M. C. (2015). Examining long-term effects of an infant mental health home-based Early Head Start program on family strengths and resilience. *Infant Mental Health Journal*, 36(4), 353–365. https://doi.org/10.1002/imhj.21518
- M. Paschall, K. W., Mastergeorge, A. M., & Ayoub, C. C. (2019). Associations between child physical abuse potential, observed maternal parenting, and young children's emotion regulation: Is participation in Early Head Start protective? *Infant Mental Health Journal*, 40(2), 169–185. https://doi.org/10.1002/imhj.21767
- N. Raikes, H. H., Vogel, C., & Love, J. M. (2013). IV. Family subgroups and impacts at ages 2, 3, and 5: Variability by race/ethnicity and demographic risk. *Monographs of the Society for Research in Child Development*, 78(1), 64–92. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-5834.2012.00703.x
- O. Robinson, J. L., & Emde, R. N. (2004). Mental health moderators of Early Head Start on parenting and child development: Maternal depression and relationship attitudes. *Parenting*, *4*(1), 73–97. https://doi.org/10.1207/s15327922par0401_4
- P. Roggman, L. A., Boyce, L. K., & Cook, G. A. (2009). Keeping kids on track: Impacts of a parenting-focused Early Head Start program on attachment security and cognitive development. *Part of Special Issue: Early Head Start: New Looks at Program Impacts*, 20(6), 920–941. https://doi.org/10.1080/10409280903118416
- Q. Roggman, L. A., & Cook, G. A. (2010). Attachment, aggression, and family risk in a low-income sample. *Family Science*, *1*(3–4), 191–204. https://doi.org/10.1080/19424620.2010.567829
- R. Vallotton, C. D., Harewood, T., Ayoub, C. A., Pan, B., Mastergeorge, A. M., & Brophy-Herb, H. (2012). Buffering boys and boosting girls: The protective and promotive effects of Early Head Start for children's expressive language in the context of parenting stress. *Early Childhood Research Quarterly*, *27*(4), 695–707. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecresq.2011.03.001
- S. Vogel, C., Brooks-Gunn, J., Martin, A., & Klute, M. M. (2013). III. Impacts of Early Head Start participation on child and parent outcomes at ages 2, 3, and 5. *Monographs of the Society for Research in Child Development, 78*(1), 36–63. https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1540-5834.2012.00702.x

- T. Vogel, C. A., Xue, Y., Moiduddin, E. M., & Lepidus Carlson, B. (2010). Early Head Start children in grade 5: Long-term follow-up of the Early Head Start Research and Evaluation Project Study sample (OPRE 2011-8; p. 193). Office of Planning, Research & Evaluation, Administration for Children & Families, US Department of Health and Human Services. https://www.acf.hhs.gov/opre/resource/early-head-start-children-in-grade-5-long-term-followup-of-the-early-head
- U. Whiteside-Mansell, L., Bradley, R., McKelvey, L., & Lopez, M. (2009). Center-based Early Head Start and children exposed to family conflict. *Early Education and Development*, 20(6), 942–957. https://doi.org/10.1080/10409280903206211
- V. Yazejian, N., Bryant, D. M., Hans, S., Horm, D., Clair, L. S., File, N., & Burchinal, M. (2017). Child and parenting outcomes after 1 year of Educare. *Child Development*, 88(5), 1671–1688. https://doi.org/10.1111/cdev.12688
- W. Yazejian, N., Bryant, D. M., Kuhn, L. J., Burchinal, M., Horm, D., Hans, S., File, N., & Jackson, B. (2020). The Educare intervention: Outcomes at age 3. Early Childhood Research Quarterly, 53, 425–440. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecresq.2020.05.008
- X. Green, B. L., Ayoub, C., Bartlett, J. D., Furrer, C., Chazan-Cohen, R., Buttitta, K., Von Ende, A., Koepp, A., & Regalbuto, E. (2020). Pathways to prevention: Early Head Start outcomes in the first three years lead to long-term reductions in child maltreatment. *Children and Youth Services Review, 118,* 105403. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.childyouth.2020.105403
- Y. Douglass, A. G., Roche, K. M., Lavin, K., Ghazarian, S. R., & Perry, D. F. (2020). Longitudinal parenting pathways linking Early Head Start and kindergarten readiness. *Early Child Development and Care*, *19*(16), 2570–2589. https://doi.org/10.1080/03004430.2020.1725498

How and why does Early Head Start vary across states?

In the absence of an evidence-based state policy lever to ensure eligible children have access to EHS, we present several choices that states can make to more effectively implement EHS. We identify states as leaders in the implementation of Early Head Start if they:

- Serve a high share of their state's eligible infants and toddlers relative to others;
- Have a state-specific program that has a similar structure and performance standards as Early Head
 Start; and
- Provide state financial support for Early Head Start or provide a state match as an Early Head Start—Child Care Partnership (EHS-CCP) grantee.

To assess if a state serves a high share of eligible infants and toddlers, we calculated the percentage of incomeeligible children in a state with access to EHS, using data from the 2019 Early Head Start Program Information Reports and population-level estimates from the 2018 and 2019 American Community Survey¹. Additional details on the calculation of this measure can be found below (see Measure 1). States identified as serving a high share of children are those that were in roughly the top third of states on this measure and typically had a substantial number of infants and toddlers in their state who may benefit from participating in EHS.

¹ The Census Bureau warned of quality issues with the 2020 American Community Survey (ACS) data due to the pandemic's impact on data collection. Due to the potential impact of these quality issues on the population we study, we opted to continue using the pooled 2018 and 2019 ACS data for the 2022 Roadmap.

We performed individual outreach to each state's Head Start Collaboration Office Director, or other relevant contact, regarding the state's funding of Early Head Start as of September 2, 2022, and whether or not state-specific funds are appropriated or leveraged to fund EHS programming. State's responses informed research pertaining to state-specific models similar to EHS. For state-funded and administered programs, researchers analyzed the design (e.g., center-based, home-based, or partnership programs) and performance standards (e.g., low child-to-staff ratios, evidence-based curricula, family engagement and comprehensive services) to assess if programs were similar to EHS. We were unable to confirm information with the relevant personnel in three states, Mississippi, Pennsylvania, and South Dakota. (For additional details, please see below in Measure 2.) The datasets, calculations, and sources referenced for each state are listed below.

To assess state progress to more effectively implement Early Head Start, we also performed an electronic search using Quorum State between August 16, 2021 and August 31, 2022 to assess legislative progress pertaining to state funding of Early Head Start programs, or EHS-like models. The main search strategy used keywords for Early Head Start (Early Head Start). Research staff conducted searches, analyzed results for relevant state legislation, and summarized the progress states made towards supplementing federal EHS funding at the state level.

This section also contains the sources for the information presented in the individual state Roadmaps.

Measure 1: Estimated percentage of income-eligible children under age 3 with access to Early Head Start

Definition:

The estimated percentage of income-eligible children (those in families whose poverty status was less than 100% of the federal poverty level) under age 3 with access to Early Head Start (as measured through the total number of funded EHS slots).

Notes:

- 1. **Numerator**: The total number of EHS slots (regardless of funding source) available in all EHS programs (traditional EHS, American Indian, Alaska Native (AIAN) and migrant EHS) as provided in state-level 2019 Program Information Reports (PIRs).
- 2. **Denominator**: The number of children under the age of 3 whose family poverty value was below 100% of the federal poverty level (FPL) based on population level estimates from the 2018 and 2019 American Community Survey (ACS) Public-Use Microdata Sample (PUMS).
- 3. The percentage reported represents the percent of income-eligible children under age 3 with access to Early Head Start but does not account for other eligibility factors.
- 4. Sample size estimates were calculated in Stata 17 using person-level weights. Given the age and income limits imposed on the sample (children under age 3 living in families below 100% of the FPL) and the estimates by state, two years of ACS data were combined to improve data quality and accuracy and all weights were appropriately adjusted to account for the two combined years of data.
- 5. Children living in group quarters or whose family poverty status was not available (e.g., foster children or children who were unrelated to the head of household) were excluded from the calculation.

- 6. The US Census calculation of poverty is based on the total income of all individuals aged 15 or older who are related to the head of household through marriage, birth or adoption. Income from cohabiting partners who are not married and unrelated children (including foster children) are not included in the calculation of family income. This family income is compared to federal poverty thresholds based on related family size and composition (povpip).²
- 7. The Census Bureau warned of quality issues with the 2020 American Community Survey (ACS) data due to the pandemic's impact on data collection. Nonresponse bias in the 2020 sample made "it appear that the U.S. population had higher levels of education, had more married couples and fewer never married individuals, had less Medicaid coverage, had higher median household incomes, had fewer noncitizens, and were more likely to live in single-family housing units" (p. 37). Due to the potential impact of these quality issues on the population we study, we opted to continue using the pooled 2018 and 2019 ACS data for the 2022 Roadmap and, therefore, continued using 2019 service data for the numerator.³
- 8. Additionally, due to the impact of COVID-19 on early care and education programs, the federal Office of Head Start did not require PIRs from Early Head Start grantees in 2020. PIRs were collected in 2021, but 2021 ACS data for the denominator were yet not available as of 2022 Roadmap publication to update this measure.

Sources:

- 1. US Census Bureau. (2019-2020). 2018-2019 American Community Survey (ACS) 1-Year Public Use Microdata Sample (PUMS) [Data Sets]. https://www.census.gov/programs-surveys/acs/microdata.html
- 2. US Department of Health & Human Services, Office of Head Start. (n.d.). 2019 Early Head Start (EHS) Program Information Report. Retrieved on August 5, 2020, from https://hses.ohs.acf.hhs.gov/pir/

Measure 2: State support for Early Head Start

Definition:

States can provide support for Early Head Start in any of the following three ways: (1) supplement federal funding for EHS programs, (2) act as an EHS-Child Care Partnership grantee and contribute state matching funds, and/or (3) have a state-specific program with a similar structure and quality standards as EHS.

Notes:

- 1. Supplemental federal funding for EHS programs is current as of September 2, 2022.
- 2. Researchers were unable to successfully receive verification from three states to confirm their state funding for EHS programs and status as an EHS-CCP grantee in 2022. These three states were Mississippi, Pennsylvania, and South Dakota. Researchers used prior data sources and personal communication to inform the assumptions for their status on these indicators in 2022.

² US Census Bureau (n.d.). *How the Census Bureau measures poverty*. As of August 27, 2019. Retrieved on April 28, 2020 from https://www.census.gov/topics/income-poverty/poverty/guidance/poverty-measures.html

³ Asiala, M., Baumgardner, S., Galvin, S., Mykyta, L., Raglin, D., Renwich, T., Shin, H., Spader, J., Spence, M. & Stern, S. (2021, October 27). *An assessment of the COVID-19 pandemic's impact on the 2020 ACS 1-Year data*. The Census Bureau. Retrieved on October 10, 2022, from https://www.census.gov/library/working-papers/2021/acs/2021 CensusBureau 01.html.

Sources:

State	Sources
Alabama	T. Calloway, Alabama Head Start Association, personal communication, September 2, 2022.
Alaska	S. Ordonez, Alaska Department of Education & Early Development, personal communication,
	August 10, 2022.
Arizona	J. Rivera-Garcia, Arizona Head Start Association, personal communication, August 23, 2022.
Arkansas	C. Musick, Arkansas River Valley Area Council Head Start, personal communication, August 2,
	2022.
California	A. Loakimedes, Head Start California, personal communication, August 9, 2022.
Colorado	H. Craiglow, Colorado Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 10, 2022.
Connecticut	E. Trueworthy, Connecticut Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 10, 2022.
Delaware	J. Marsh, Delaware Department of Education, personal communication, August 3, 2022.
District of Columbia	K. Kigera, District of Columbia Office of the State Superintendent of Education, personal communication, August 8, 2022.
Florida	K. Singer, Florida Department of Education, personal communication, August 10, 2022.
Georgia	J. Yancey, Georgia Head Start Association, personal communication, August 22, 2022.
Hawaii	C. Jackson, Hawaii Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 4, 2022.
Idaho	B. Foxcroft, Idaho Head Start Association, personal communication, August 22, 2022.
Illinois	W. Williams, Illinois Head Start State Collaboration Office, August 2, 2022.
Indiana	T. Carriger, Indiana Head Start State Collaboration Office, August 2, 2022.
lowa	M. Garner, Iowa Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 2, 2022.
Kansas	K. Kennedy, Kansas department for Children and Families, personal communication, August 26, 2022.
Kentucky	L. Baker, Kentucky Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, September 7, 2022.
Louisiana	K. Wahid, Louisiana Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 31, 2022.
Maine	N. Cunningham, Maine Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 2, 2022.
	Maine State Legislature, Office of Fiscal and Program Review. (July, 2022). <i>Total Appropriations and Allocations All Funds 2022-2023 Biennium</i> . Retrieved on August 31, 2022, from
	https://legislature.maine.gov/doc/8694
Maryland	V. Jones, Maryland Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 3, 2022.
Massachusetts	A. Whitehead-Pleaux, Massachusetts Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal
	communication, August 10, 2022.
Michigan	Fiscal Year 2023 Final Budget, Chapter 126, (July, 2022).
Michigan	C. Derby, Michigan Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 2, 2022.
Minnesota	J. Dickhausen, Minnesota Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 10, 2022.
Mississippi	National Head Start Association. (2020). State investments in Head Start to support at-risk children
	and families [fact sheet]. Retrieved on May 30, 2020, from
	https://www.nhsa.org/files/state_investments_in_head_start.pdf

State	Sources
Missouri	L. Kavanaugh, Missouri Department of Elementary and Secondary Education, personal
	communication, August 8, 2022.
Montana	K. Filipovich, Montana Head Start Association, personal communication, August 30, 2022.
	S. Knust, Nebraska Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 2,
Nebraska	2022.
	Sixpence Early Learning Fund. (2020, September). Sixpence early learning fund 2019-2020
	evaluation report. Retrieved from https://www.singasongofsixpence.org/-lb-342/what-is-
	sixpence.html
Nevada	P. Gardner, Nevada Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 8,
	2022.
New Hampshire	D. Nelson, New Hampshire Child Development and Head Start Collaboration, personal
	communication, August 26, 2022.
New Jersey	D. Henix, & B. Eggenburg, New Jersey Head Start Collaboration Office & New Jersey Head Start
	Association, personal communication, August 2, 2022.
New Mexico	J. Archuleta, & E. Groginsky, New Mexico Early childhood Education & Care Department, personal
ivew iviexico	communication, August 9, 2022.
New York	P. Persell, New York State Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 2,
INEM TOLK	2022.
North Carolina	M. Jones, North Carolina Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August
INOTHI CATOIIIIA	9, 2022.
North Dakota	C. Kueber, North Dakota Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 4,
INDICII DAKULA	2022.
Ohio	A. Armstrong, Ohio Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, September 1, 2022.
Oklahoma	P. Brown, Oklahoma Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 11, 2022.
Oregon	G. Bachtle, Oregon Earl Learning Division, personal communication, August 11, 2022.
Pennsylvania	T. Duarte, Pennsylvania Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, June 17, 2021.
Rhode Island	C. Green, Rhode Island Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, September 1,
	2022.
South Carolina	M. Diggs, South Carolina Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 4,
	2022.
South Dakota	J. Berscheid, South Dakota Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, June 23,
	2021.
Tennessee	H. Murphy, Tennessee Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 8,
	2022.
Texas	A. Giles, Texas Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 5, 2022.
Utah	K. Kohler, Utah Collaboration for Head Start, personal communication, August 11, 2022.
Vermont	R. Kelly, Vermont Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 11, 2022.
Virginia	T. Jeffries, Virginia Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 30, 2022.
Washington	C. Garland, Washington Head Start Collaboration office, personal communication, August 31, 2022.
West Virginia	B. Doss, West Virginia Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 26,
	2022.
	2022.

State	Sources
Wisconsin	J. Clemens, Wisconsin Head Start State Collaboration Office, personal communication, September 1, 2022.
Wyoming	H. Wagner, Wyoming Head Start Collaboration Office, personal communication, August 5, 2022.